### cber.co Final Review of Colorado 2018 and Outlook for 2019

Colorado-based Business and Economic Research Prepared March 20, 2019

## Overview and Highlights Colorado

This chartbook provides a series of graphs, tables, and discussions that tell the story about what caused changes in the Colorado economy in 2018 and what will drive changes in 2019. It focuses on the topics listed in the left hand column, with special attention given to the benchmark revisions for employment, unemployment, wage data, and GDP. A similar review of the U.S. economy can be found by going to <a href="https://cber.co/economic-updates/">https://cber.co/economic-updates/</a>.

#### The Colorado Economy

- Outlook Highlights
- Gross Domestic Product
- Federal Reserve Indicators
- Population Components of Change
- Employment, Unemployment Rate, and the Unemployment Gap
- Revised Employment Outlook, Employment by Sector, Employment by Strong Growth, Solid Growth, Volatile Categories
- Colorado and U.S. Wages
- Denver International Airport
- Building Permits, Housing Prices, and Inflation
- Oil Production and Prices
- Retail Trade and Auto Registrations
- State Government Revenue
- Summary of the Colorado Economy

This chartbook gives special attention to the following data sets:

- Unemployment the unemployment rate for Q4 2018 was 0.8 percentage points greater than the prior year. Is there reason to be concerned?
- Employment employment data for Q4 2018 came in below expectations. How much momentum will the economy have moving in to mid-2019?
- Wages Colorado wages increased by 5.4% in 2018. What is the story behind this level of wage growth?

## Outlook Highlights

Key statistics for the Colorado economic forecast are listed below. There is greater downside risk than upside potential to the 2019 Colorado forecast.

### GDP, Leading Indicators, Population, Unemployment, and Employment

- 2019 Colorado real GDP, +3.1%.
- 2018 GDP drivers real estate, government, PST, manufacturing, healthcare.
- Fed leading indicators continued growth in Colorado.
- 2019 Population 1.3% growth, 76,200 people.
- Unemployment 2018 revised upward to 3.3%.
- Unemployment 2019 forecast revised upward to 3.6%.
- Initial and continuing claims trending downward.
- Employment 2018 revised downward to 64,600.
- Employment 2019 forecast revised downward to 58,600.

### Wages, DIA, Construction, Housing, Inflation, Oil, State General Fund

- Colorado AAWW increased by 5.4% in 2018.
- Colorado AAWW increased by 2.0% CAGR since 2009 to 2018.
- DIA 64.5 million passengers in 2018, another record will be set in 2019.
- Construction 42,500 residential permits in 2019.
- Housing prices increasing at a decreasing rate.
- Inflation (CPI)– 2.6% in Colorado vs. 2.3% for U.S.
- New vehicle registrations flat in 2018 and 2019, pickup sales dominate car sales.
- Retail trade sales, will increase by 3.6% in 2019.
- Oil production, up almost 16% in 2019 new record.
- State General Fund, slower rate of growth in 2019.

A number of data series are re	eleased in February	and March that	close out 2018.	The following are	release dates of
cber.co reports in Q1 2019.					

- January 15<sup>th</sup> 2019 cber.co Economic Forecast
- February 25<sup>th</sup>
   In-depth year-end review of 2018 U.S. economy
- March 20<sup>th</sup> Benchmark data and in-depth review for Colorado 2018 and 2019 outlook
- March 29<sup>th</sup>
   Review of first two months of 2019.

# •

### The Colorado Economy Gross Domestic Product

### **Things to Look For** Gross Domestic Product - Colorado

- About half the state's GDP is derived from the real estate, government, PST, manufacturing, and health care sectors.
- Colorado has a competitive advantage (GDP) in the extractive industries, AER, construction, and PST.
- Colorado's GDP growth rate is usually greater than the U.S. growth rate. That will be the case in 2019.
- In 2017, the major contributors to GDP growth were PST, MCE, real estate, retail trade and wholesale trade.
- Almost 80% of the total Colorado MSA GDP is in Denver and Colorado Springs.
- The top MSAs for GDP growth, from 2009 to 2017, were Boulder, Fort Collins, and Pueblo.
- The top areas for real per capita GDP are Boulder and Fort Collins.

The primary focus of most economic forecasts is employment. It is also important to look at the industries that contribute to the GDP and GDP growth. All industries make unique and important contributions to the economy.

## 2017 Current Gross Domestic Product

2017 Gross Domestic Product (Current Dollars)								
Sector	ι	Jnited States	Percent	Colorado	Percent			
Real estate and rental	\$	2,591,221	13.30%	\$ 51,200	14.83%			
Government	\$	2,453,704	12.59%	\$ 42,298	12.25%			
Prof., Scient., and Tech.	\$	1,449,993	7.44%	\$ 32,796	9.50%			
Manufacturing	\$	2,179,633	11.19%	\$ 23,015	6.67%			
Health care	\$	1,454,719	7.47%	\$ 22,266	6.45%			
Wholesale trade	\$	1,174,123	6.03%	\$ 20,024	5.80%			
Construction	\$	781,413	4.01%	\$19,317	5.60%			
Finance and insurance	\$	1,465,909	7.52%	\$19,092	5.53%			
Information	\$	1,050,767	5.39%	\$18,823	5.45%			
Retail trade	\$	1,087,107	5.58%	\$18,578	5.38%			
Transp. & warehousing	\$	608,735	3.12%	\$12,953	3.75%			
Acc. and food services	\$	590,589	3.03%	\$ 11,830	3.43%			
Extractive Industries	\$	268,619	1.38%	\$11,187	3.24%			
Adm. and waste mgmt.	\$	606,974	3.12%	\$10,846	3.14%			
Other services	\$	416,083	2.14%	\$ 7,975	2.31%			
Mgmt. of Companies	\$	369,380	1.90%	\$ 7,427	2.15%			
Arts, ent., and recreation	\$	214,148	1.10%	\$ 6,061	1.76%			
Utilities	\$	307,496	1.58%	\$ 3,838	1.11%			
Educational services	\$	245,556	1.26%	\$ 3,047	0.88%			
Agriculture	\$	169,225	0.87%	\$ 2,660	0.77%			
Total	\$	19,485,394	100.0%	\$ 345,233	100.0%			

The concentration is the Colorado percentage divided by the United States percentage. Colorado has a greater concentration for sectors greater than 1.0 and a smaller concentration for sectors less than 1.0

Source: Bureau of Economic Analysis, cber.co.

Colorado-based Business and Economic Research http://cber.co

**Concentration of Colorado GDP by Industry Sectors** 



# Real Gross Domestic Product Colorado vs. U.S. (Annual)

The Annual Rate of Change for the Real Gross Domestic Product



Source: Bureau of Economic Analysis. Note: U.S. real GDP is summary of states GDP.

# Real Gross Domestic Product Colorado vs. U.S. (Quarterly - Annualized)

Change in the Quarterly Rate of Change for Real Gross Domestic Product



Source: Bureau of Economic Analysis. Note: U.S. real GDP is summary of states GDP.

# 2017 Contribution to Real GDP by Sector Colorado

#### Prof., Scient., and Tech. 0.46 Mgmt. of Companies 0.35 Real estate and rental 0.32 0.25 Retail trade Wholesale trade 0.24 Transp. & warehousing 0.20 Government 0.19 0.18 Extractive Industries Health care 0.16 The Colorado real GDP Construction 0.16 increased by 2.7% in 2017, Adm. and waste mgmt. 0.16 the most current year that Manufacturing 0.11 state data is available. The top Arts, ent., and recreation 0.11 15 sectors contributed 3.04% Acc. and food services 0.11 percentage points to the real Other services 0.04 GDP and the bottom 5 sectors Agriculture -0.03 were a drag on the state Educational services -0.03 economy, -.037% percentage Utilities -0.07 points. -0.11 Finance and insurance Information -0.13 -0.2 -0.1 0.0 0.1 0.2 0.3 0.4 0.5 0.6

#### Percentage Points of Contribution to Colorado Real GDP

Source: Bureau of Economic Analysis. Note: This reflects change from the prior period.

# Industry Contribution to Colorado Real GDP

#### **Industry Contribution to Real GDP**

The table on the next page looks at the contribution of six industries to Colorado real GDP between 2010 and 2017. (Extractive industries, construction, real estate, health care, PST, and AER). The values in the table illustrate how the contribution of these industries can be volatile from year-toyear. In addition, a sector or group of sectors may dominate GDP growth one year, but not the next year.

#### Volatility of Industry Contribution

The following are examples of the fluctuation in the contribution of various industries:

- Volatility in the extractive industries is caused by changes in the price of related commodities and public policy. In turn, these price changes affect demand. The data in the table shows the extractive industries were a drag on real GDP growth in 2010 and 2016. In 2014 they were responsible for about 25% of the state's real GDP growth (1.1 percentage points out of 4.4 points).
- In another example, real estate was responsible for about 33% of the state's growth in 2016 or .76 of 2.33 percentage points.
- In a final example, the top six industries accounted for about 91% of real GDP growth in 2011.

## Contribution of Key Industries to Colorado Real GDP - 2017 Measured in Percentage Points

	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
Extractive Industries	-0.65	0.07	0.15	0.28	1.10	0.65	-0.21	0.18
Construction	-0.76	0.00	0.13	0.68	0.50	0.32	0.31	0.16
Real Estate	0.69	0.70	0.09	0.22	0.21	0.77	0.76	0.32
Health Care	0.08	0.14	0.16	0.10	0.26	0.33	0.28	0.16
Professional, Scientific, Tech.	0.31	0.27	0.37	0.38	0.42	0.27	0.35	0.46
Leisure and Hospitality	0.13	0.18	0.06	0.42	0.20	0.30	0.03	0.22
*Other Industries	<u>1.10</u>	<u>0.14</u>	<u>0.84</u>	<u>1.22</u>	<u>1.71</u>	<u>1.66</u>	<u>0.78</u>	<u>1.20</u>
Total of Six Industries	-0.20	1.36	0.96	2.08	2.69	2.64	1.52	1.50
Total Real GDP Growth (%)	0.9	1.5	1.8	3.3	4.4	4.3	2.3	2.7
Six Industries as a % of Total GDP	-22.2%	90.7%	53.3%	63.0%	61.1%	61.4%	66.1%	55.6%

Source: Bureau of Economic Analysis, cber.co. Note: \*Other Industries includes Agriculture, Utilities, Manufacturing, Wholesale Trade, Retail Trade, Information, Management of Companies and Enterprises, Administrative Services, Finance and Insurance, Educational Services, Other Services, and Government.

# Current Dollar GDP Colorado MSA



Source: Bureau of Economic Analysis, current dollars, cber.co. Note: The percentage is based on MSA total GDP, does not include non-MSA area.



**Real Per Capital GDP by MSA** 



Source: Bureau of Economic Analysis, chained on 2009, cber.co. Note: The most available data is 2017. Population data reflect mid-year values (2017).

### The Colorado Economy

Federal Reserve Leading and Coincident Indicators

# Philadelphia Fed Coincident Index Colorado vs. U.S.

Philadelphia Federal Reserve Coincident Index – Colorado and U.S.

#### Index Value



Source: Philadelphia Federal Reserve, cber.co. Note: The leading index predicts the six-month growth rate of the U.S. and state's coincident index.

# Philadelphia Fed Leading Index Colorado vs. U.S.

Philadelphia Federal Reserve Leading Index – Colorado and U.S.



Source: Philadelphia Federal Reserve, cber.co. Note: The leading index predicts the six-month growth rate of the U.S. and state's coincident index.

## Philadelphia Federal Reserve Indices No Signs of a Recession

The leading and coincident indices produced by the Philadelphia Federal Reserve are two of many indicators that show the U.S. and Colorado economies are on solid footing, at least for the first half of 2019.

There are headwinds, but not clear signs of a recession. There may be a slowdown, but that is not the same as a recession.

### The Colorado Economy Population Components of Change

## Colorado Population Components of Change

Population increases and decreases are a result of the natural rate of change (births minus deaths) and the change in net migration (people moving into the state minus people moving out of the state).

Over the past 3½ decades the natural rate of change (red bars) varied from a low of 26,700 in 2018 to a peak of 41,124 in 2007. Fertility rates have declined. As a result, the natural rate for 2019 will be 26,200.

Changes resulting from net migration (blue bars) are closely tied to the strength of the economy and the change in state employment. For example, there were five years, from 1986 to 1990, when net migration was negative. More people moved out of state than moved into the state to escape the regional recession. During the past two recessions (2001 and 2007), net migration declined, but did not turn negative. It was difficult for people to move anywhere to escape the bad economy.

The Colorado population will increase by about 75,000 for the years 2016 to 2020. In 2019 the state's population will increase by 1.3%, or 76,200 to 5,765,527.





#### Change in Colorado Population 1980 - 2020

•

### The Colorado Economy

Unemployment Rate and the Unemployment Gap

## Things to Look For Unemployment - Colorado

- The downward trend in the number of initial and continuing claims suggests the unemployment rate will not rise abruptly in the near term, particularly given the growth of the labor force.
- The unemployment rate for 2018 was 3.3%. This was higher than expected.
- As a result, the projected unemployment rate for 2019 was increased to 3.6%.
- In Q4 2018, the YOY increase in the state's unemployment rate was 0.8 percentage points. After closer investigation, this difference does not appear to be a problem.
- Lower U.S. unemployment rates may eventually cause a decline in Colorado's net migration. At some point, this may affect the number of jobs added and the unemployment rate for Colorado.

Initially, there was concern the YOY increase in the state's unemployment rate had risen to 0.8 percentage points in Q4 2018. As a result, this section focuses on changes in the unemployment rate.

### Unemployment Rate vs. Colorado

In 2019, the annual unemployment rate for the U.S. will decline to 3.6%. In the past 50 years only 1969 was lower at 3.5%. The Colorado rate will increase for the second consecutive year from 3.3% in 2018 to 3.6% in 2019.

The annual U.S. unemployment rate has declined since 2010 when it was 9.6%. The rate has been below 4.5% since 2017.

The annual Colorado unemployment rate peaked at 8.7% in 2010. It bottomed out in 2017 at 2.7%. The rate has been below 4.5% since 2015.

By comparison, there was an 8-year period, 1994 to 2001, when Colorado's annual rate of unemployment was less than 4.5%.



#### Unemployment Rate – U.S. vs. Colorado

Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, SA; cber.co.

# YOY Change in the Unemployment Rate Colorado



Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, LAUS, NSA, NBER, cber.co.

### • YOY Change in the Labor Force Colorado



Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, LAUS, NSA, NBER, cber.co.

# Initial and Continuing Unemployment Claims 1990 to 2018 (Colorado)



Source: FRED, Department of Labor, NSA, cber.co.

# The Unemployment Gap (U.S. Rate Minus CO Rate) The Gap vs. Net Migration



Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, State Demographers Office, cber.co.

## Colorado Unemployment Rate

The unemployment rate will remain below the natural rate of unemployment through 2019. As a result, the state economy will continue to perform in an inefficient manner.

There are companies in all sectors that are not adequately staffed. Unfortunately, their customers often have to deal with poor service and long wait times – in some cases there is even no service.

Given the low U.S. unemployment rate, most states are facing similar challenges as Colorado. There are low unemployment rates in <u>key</u> <u>occupations</u>, <u>key industries</u>, and in most <u>geographic areas</u> of the state and U.S.

Just as there was no place to hide from the high unemployment rates of the Great Recession, there is no place to hide from the ill effects of an unemployment rate that is too low. Having said that, it is much better to deal with an unemployment rate that is too low than to deal with one that is too high.

# •

### The Colorado Economy

Revised Employment Outlook, Employment by Sector, Employment by Strong Growth, Solid Growth, Volatile Categories

## Things to Look For Employment - Colorado

- The benchmark data for 2018 showed the state added 64,600 workers, less than expected.
- As a result, the 2019 cber.co forecast for employment was lowered to 58,600 jobs, or a 2.2% rate of growth.
- Job growth for the period 2012 to 2019 is almost as strong as the eight year period 1993 to 2000.
- There will continue to be consistent job growth in the strong and solid categories of industries. There will be a decline in the volatile categories, particularly as the year progresses.

A slowdown in job growth was expected for Q4; however, the magnitude of the slowdown was greater than anticipated. As a result, this section tries to understand the level of momentum that will carry forward into 2019 and how that momentum will affect the performance of the Colorado economy.

# Annual Employment Change in Colorado Employment

All economists were fooled by the strength of the economy in 2018. It appears their forecasts for a slowdown were a year too early. The recent benchmark data shows that Colorado added 64,900 jobs in 2018, or growth of 2.4%.

This level of job growth is 10,000 to 20,000 jobs greater than most forecasts, but less than the end of the year expectations for 2018. Job growth for 2018 peaked in the summer, but it tapered off in the second half of the year.

The momentum from 2018 will carry forward into the first half of 2019; however, this momentum is projected to taper off as the year progresses.

Employment growth for 2019 will be 58,600 workers, an increase of 2.2%. On average this is about 4,900 workers per month.



Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, cber.co.

## 58,600 Jobs to be Added What Adjective Would You Use to Describe 58,600?

Economists are masters at using adjectives and phrases to describe economic growth. Some examples are listed below:

- Above expectations
- Average
- Below par
- Below potential
- Booming
- Cautiously optimistic
- Consistent
- Disappointing
- Dismal
- Moderate
- Modest
- Solid
- Stable
- Stellar
- Strong
- Trending upwards
- Weak
- Worse than expected
- Worst case scenario

The list goes on ad nauseam.

Later this year, the U.S. economy will set a record for the longest economic recovery in history. Does that mean the current level of job growth is strong, weak, or somewhere in between? What words or phrases would you use to describe Colorado's forecast for the addition of 58,600 jobs in 2019?

### Change in Employment by Sector 2019 Forecast

Construction Accommodations and Food Services Professional and Scientific Health Care Retail Trade Higher Education Transportation and Warehousing, and Utilities Natural Resources and Mining Arts, Entertnmt, and Recreation Wholesale Trade Information Personal (Other) Services Corporate Headquarters (MCE) **Employment Services** Manufacturing **Financial Activities** Admin (Not Employment Services) Private Education Local (Not K-12 Education) State (Not Higher Education) K-12 Education Federal Government Utilities

Job Change All Sectors



Thousands (Average)

Source: BLS, cber.co.

# Annual Employment Situation for the Strong Growth Category

For almost three decades the following sectors have been the foundation for consistent growth in Colorado employment.

- Professional, Scientific, and Technical Services
- Management of Companies and Enterprises
- Administrative Services (Not Employment Services)
- Private Education
- Higher Education (Public)
- Health Care
- Arts, Entertainment, and Recreation
- Other Services.

Total employment for this category was:

1998 581,900 workers, 28.3% of total employment2008 759,400 workers, 32.3% of total employment2018 960.900 workers, 35.2% of total employment

In 2019, 22,900 workers will be added at a rate of 2.4%.



Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, cber.co.

#### Annual Employment Situation for the Solid Growth Category

For almost three decades the following sectors generally posted gains. The category posted stronger jobs gains during the 1990s than the 2000s and 2010s.

- Wholesale Trade
- Retail Trade
- State (Not Higher Education)
- Local (Not K-12 Education)
- K-12 Education
- Accommodations and Food Services.

Total employment for this category was: 1998 763,300 workers, 35.8% of total employment 2008 856,000 workers, 36.4% of total employment 2018 996,200 workers, 36.0% of total employment

### In 2019, 15,600 jobs will be added, at a rate of 1.6%.



Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, cber.co.

#### Annual Employment Situation for the Volatile Category

For almost three decades the sectors listed below were the primary source of volatility in total employment.

- The sectors are:
- •Natural Resources and Mining
- Construction
- Manufacturing
- •Transportation and Warehousing
- •Utilities
- •Employment Services
- Financial Activities
- Information
- •Federal Government.

Total employment for this category was: 1998 739,000 workers, 35.9% of total employment 2008 734,000 workers, 31.2% of total employment 2018 784,000 workers, 28.8% of total employment

In 2019 20,100 jobs will be added, at a rate of 2.6%.



Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, cber.co.

## **Key Sectors** Strong Growth, Solid Growth, and Volatile Categories

The following slides show the change in employment for key sectors in the strong growth, solid growth, and volatile categories.

- The green bars represent sectors from the strong growth category.
- The yellow bars represent sectors from the solid growth category.
- The red bars represent the volatile category.

The state is projected to add 58,600 jobs in 2019.

The total jobs added by category follows:

- Strong Growth 22,900 jobs
- Solid Growth 15,600 jobs
- Volatile 20,100 jobs.
## Change in Employment

#### Health Care and Social Assistance and Higher Education Strong Growth Category



Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, cber.co.

## Change in Employment

 Leisure and Hospitality - Arts, Entertainment, and Recreation and Accommodations and Food Services – Strong and Solid Growth Categories



Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, cber.co.

# Change in Employment Professional, Scientific, and Technical Services Strong Growth Category



Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, cber.co.

# Change in Employment Administrative Services, Excluding Employment Services Strong Growth Category



Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, cber.co.



#### Solid Growth Category



Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, cber.co.

#### Change in Employment State Government (Not Higher education)

#### Solid Growth Category



Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, cber.co.





Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, cber.co.

## Change in Employment

#### Employment Services Volatile Growth Category



Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, cber.co.

## Change in Employment

#### Extractive Industries

#### Volatile Growth Category



Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, cber.co.

# •

#### The Colorado Economy

Colorado Wages (Average Annual Weekly Wages – AAWW)

### Average Annual Weekly Wages Colorado vs. United States

The following is a summary of key findings in the analysis of AAWW for Colorado and the U.S.

#### Colorado

- Between 2009 and 2018, Colorado private wages increased at a CAGR of 2.0%.
- Between 2009 and 2018, the Denver-Aurora-Lakewood CPI increased at a CAGR of 2.6%.
- In 2018, AAWW for private sector wages increased by 5.4% in Colorado.
- The CAGR wage growth in the construction, financial activities, leisure and hospitality, and other services sectors was greater than private sector CAGR wage growth for the period 2009 to 2018.
- The Colorado sectors with the highest AAWW were financial activities, PBS, manufacturing, and construction. There is little difference in the AAWW for the top 3 sectors.
- There is much greater volatility in the Colorado AAWW on a year-to-year basis than the U.S. wages.

#### **United States**

- Between 2009 and 2018, United States private wages increased at a CAGR of 2.5%.
- Between 2009 and 2018, the United States CPI increased at a CAGR of 1.8%.
- In 2018, AAWW for private sector wages increased by 3.3% in the United States.
- The CAGR wage growth in the construction, financial activities, leisure and hospitality, and other services sectors was greater than private sector CAGR wage growth for the period 2009 to 2018.
- The U.S. sectors with the highest AAWW were financial activities, PBS, construction, and manufacturing. The financial activities AAWW are significantly greater than the wages for the other sectors.



\$1,310 **Financial Activities** \$1,264 \$1,178 Professional Business Services \$1,260 \$1,107 Manufacturing \$1,242 \$1,174 Construction \$1,124 \$936 PRIVATE U.S. \$975 Colorado \$781 Other Services \$888 \$890 Overall, AAWW for the Education and Health Services \$839 private sector are greater for Colorado than the \$806 Trade, Transportation, Utiliities U.S. The AAWW for four \$783 sectors are greater for \$417 Leisure and Hospitality Colorado than the U.S. \$469 \$0 \$100 \$600 \$700 \$800 \$900 \$1,000 \$1,100 \$1,200 \$1,300 \$1,400 \$200 \$300 \$400 \$500

#### AAWW by Sector (Sorted by Colorado)

Source: BLS, cber.co.

# Change in AAWW- Colorado vs. U.S. 2018 vs. Compound Annualized Growth Rate 2009-2018



Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, cber.co.

## Average Annual Weekly Wages Private Sector

Average Annual Weekly Wages \$1,000 \$975 \$950 Colorado's AAWW are \$925 consistently greater than the U.S. \$900 \$875 \$850 \$825 \$800 \$775 \$750 \$725 \$700 \$675 2007 2009 2011 2013 2015 2017 Colorado United States



Source: BLS, cber.co.

## Average Annual Weekly Wages Construction

Average Annual Weekly Wages



#### 14.0% The increase in Colorado's AAWW is usually 13.0% 12.0% less than U.S. Colorado had greater 11.0% increases in 2013, 2014, and 2018. 10.0% 9.0% 8.0% 7.0% 6.0% 5.0% 4.0% 3.0% 2.0% 1.0% 0.0% -1.0% -2.0% -3.0% -4.0% 2008 2010 2012 2014 2018 2016 Colorado

Annual Percent Change in AAWW

Source: BLS, cber.co.

## Average Annual Weekly Wages Manufacturing

Average Annual Weekly Wages





Source: BLS, cber.co.

## Average Annual Weekly Wages Trade, Transportation, and Utilities



Source: BLS, cber.co.

### Average Annual Weekly Wages **Financial Activities**





The increases in the Colorado AAWW are

Source: BLS, cber.co.

## Average Annual Weekly Wages Professional Business Services





Source: BLS, cber.co.

## Average Annual Weekly Wages Education and Health Services





Source: BLS, cber.co.

## Average Annual Weekly Wages Leisure and Hospitality



Source: BLS, cber.co.

## Average Annual Weekly Wages **Other Services**

Average Annual Weekly Wages



Annual Percent Change in AAWW

2012

2014

Source: BLS, cber.co.

Colorado-based Business and Economic Research http://cber.co

2018

2016

### Average Annual Weekly Wages Reasons for Varying Wage Growth

Given the low unemployment rate in Colorado, it is surprising to see that the annualized rate of wage growth in Colorado has been less than the rate for the U.S. This difference may be a result of factors such as the mix of companies and occupations in various industries, public and private policy, investment in technology rather than employees, the lack of technology adoption, financial strength of companies within the industries, perceived demand for workers, and the strength of unions in the state.

#### The Colorado Economy Denver International Airport

### Denver International Airport Passenger Count



Source: FlyDenver.com, cber.co.

## Denver International Airport Passengers - 2018



Source: FlyDenver.com, cber.co.

#### Denver International Airport Cargo – Pounds



Source: FlyDenver.com, cber.co.

•

#### The Colorado Economy Building Permits, Housing Prices, and Inflation

#### Colorado Residential Building Permits Annual Number of Units



Source: TAMU Real Estate Center, U.S. Census Bureau, cber.co.

#### Case Shiller Home Price Index National vs. Denver Index Value



Source: S&P Core-Logic Case-Shiller, cber.co.

#### Case Shiller Home Price Index National vs. Denver Rate of Change



Source: S&P Core-Logic Case-Shiller, cber.co.

# Housing Prices

Given the strength of net migration in Colorado, there will continue to be strong demand for housing. The rate of price appreciation may slow, but it is unlikely there will be a strong downturn in housing prices in the near term.

The rate of increase in Denver housing and rental prices has been greater than wage gains. As a result, Denver has been recognized by Redfin as one of the "most fled" cities in the country. This type of notoriety will create problems for the Colorado economy.

## Colorado vs. U.S.



Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, SA, cber.co.

•

#### The Colorado Economy Oil Production and Prices

## Average Annual Field Production of Crude Oil 2011 to 2019 (Thousand Barrels per day)



Source: EIA, cber.co.





Source. FRED, EIA, CDEI.CO.
# •

## The Colorado Economy

### Retail Trade Sales and New Vehicle Registrations





Source: OSPB, cber.co.





Source: Colorado Auto Dealers Association, cber.co.





### The Colorado Economy State Government

### The State of the State Revenue and Economic Projections

This section shows Gross General Fund revenue projections from FY 2018 to FY 2021 provided by the Colorado Legislative Council (CLC) and the Governor's Office of State Planning and Budgeting (OSPB). The Colorado Fiscal Year is July 1st through June 30<sup>th</sup>.

**Net Income Tax Revenue** accounts for about two-thirds of the Gross General Fund Revenue. Income Tax Revenue for FY 2019 is projected to be about \$8.3 billion.

**Excise and Sales Tax Revenue** accounts for about 30% of the Gross General Fund Revenue. The Sales Tax Revenue for FY 2019 is projected to be slightly less than \$3.8 billion.

**Other Revenue** accounts for about 3% of the Gross General Fund Revenue and includes a variety of miscellaneous sources.

**Gross General Fund Revenue** for FY 2019 is the sum of the above 3 categories. Total revenue for 2019 is projected to be about \$12.4 billion.

The quarterly economic updates published by CLC and OSPB are recommended reading for those anxious to learn more about the Colorado economy and funding of the state government.

## Colorado Net Income Tax

Net Income Tax to General Fund



Source: Colorado Legislative Council and OSPB December 2018.

# Colorado Excise and Sales Tax Revenue

**Excise and Sales Tax Revenue** 



Source: Colorado Legislative Council and OSPB, December 2018.

# Colorado Gross General Fund Revenue

**Gross General Fund Revenue** 



Source: Colorado Legislative Council and OSPB, December 2018.

## Proposed Legislation

Legislation has been introduced to the 72<sup>nd</sup> Colorado General Assembly that has the potential to hinder or help the growth of the state and the economy – depending on your perspective. Stay tuned!

# •

### The Colorado Economy Summary

### Annual Employment Change in Colorado Employment

The recent benchmark data produced by the Bureau of Labor Statistics shows that 64,600 jobs were added in 2018. The rate of job growth ended up being slower than anticipated because Q4 growth was disappointing. This raises the question, "How much momentum is there and how long will it last?"

Job growth for 2019 will be 58,600 workers. Colorado employment is projected to increase by 2.2%.

The rate of job growth for Colorado will again be greater than the rate for the U.S. The forecast is in line with the slowing rate of growth in the global and U.S. economies.



### Annual Change in Colorado Employment

Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics, cber.co.

## The Colorado Economy in 2019

### Watch for the Following in 2019

- **Colorado Economy** In 2019, The slowing in the Colorado economy will mirror the global and U.S. economies.
- **Real GDP** The Colorado real GDP growth rate will be greater than the U.S. rate and will be driven by health care, real estate, and the extractive industries in 2019.
- **Net Migration** Net migration has trended downward since 2015. The natural rate of increase in population will remain flat as a result of the decreasing fertility rate.
- **Employment** Colorado's rate of job growth, 2.2%, will be less than 2018; 58,600 jobs will be added.
- **Unemployment** The unemployment rate will increase to 3.6%.
- Lack of Trained Workers The Colorado economy is not operating efficiently because the unemployment rate is too low. There are not enough qualified, trained, and clean workers to fill jobs in many sectors.
- Colorado's Three Economies There are three economies in Colorado: MSAs, micropolitan areas such as Durango, and rural Colorado. It is an understatement to say that many rural counties are significantly challenged.

- Job Growth Employment growth will be driven by construction, AFS, PST, healthcare, and retail trade. Retail trade and the AFS sectors are evolving, in part because there are too many business establishments. Sales growth will remain solid, but employment growth will be modest. Construction along the Front Range has benefitted from the warm and dry winter, but it has been constrained by the lack of qualified workers. PST growth continues to be the foundation of job and GDP growth for the state.
- **Weather** The weather will continue to have a significant impact on the tourism, agriculture, and construction industries.
- Inflation The Colorado inflation rate will decline; however, it will continue to be greater than the U.S. rate.
- Future Economic Drivers Welcome to the Spaceport and Gaylord – economic drivers of the future! In addition, companies such as Lockheed, Ball Aerospace, Maxar, and Vestas continue to secure business that make Colorado a leader in technology.
- Legislature Historically, there has been overreach when one party controls the executive and legislative branches of the state government. Critical issues will take a backseat to issues that have a higher priority for the party in control.

### cber.co Final Review of Colorado 2018 and Outlook for 2019

 This analysis is for informational purposes only. Any opinions or interpretations of data are those of the presenter. As such, they do not represent the viewpoints of any group or particular organization.
For further information contact Colorado-based Business and Economic Research (cber.co). ©Copyright 2019 by cber.co.

Data contained in the tables, charts, and text of this presentation is from sources in the public domain. With appropriate credit, it may be reproduced and shared without permission. Please reference, "Colorado-based Business and Economic Research" (cber.co). Additional presentations are available at <a href="https://cber.co">https://cber.co</a>.

For additional information contact cber.co at cber@cber.co or gary@garyhorvath.com.

### ABOUT THE AUTHOR

Gary Horvath has produced annual employment forecasts of the state economy for over 25 years. They have been supplemented by monthly economic updates and indices that track economic performance over the short term. In addition, he has directed three statewide analyses that included reviews of all 64 county economies.

Horvath was the principal investigator for a state and federally funded project to prepare a nanotechnology roadmap for Colorado. As well, he was a co-founder of the Colorado Photonics Industry Association, a trade group for Colorado's Photonics cluster. Horvath has been an active board member of the group since its inception.

Horvath has also served on the Board of Directors for the Economic Development Council of Colorado, Northwest Denver Business Partnership, Adams County Economic Development, and Broomfield Economic Development Corporation. Horvath has also been the lead for the photonics/electronics cluster in OEDIT's early stage and proof of concept grant program.